



Surveillance Impact Report

Office of Economic and Workforce Development
Security Cameras

As required by San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B, departments must submit a Surveillance Impact Report for each surveillance technology to the Committee on Information Technology ("COIT") and the Board of Supervisors.

The Surveillance Impact Report details the benefits, costs, and potential impacts associated with the Department's use of surveillance cameras.

DESCRIPTION OF THE TECHNOLOGY

The Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) advances equitable and shared prosperity for San Franciscans by growing sustainable jobs, supporting businesses of all sizes, creating great places to live and work, and helping everyone achieve economic self-sufficiency.

In line with its mission, OEWD's Invest In Neighborhoods (IIN) initiative provides focused, customized assistance to strengthen and revitalize San Francisco's neighborhood commercial corridors including historic Chinatown. IIN leverages City departments and resources to respond to the specific needs and opportunities of each neighborhood, and increase merchants and residents' satisfaction with their commercial districts. The Chinatown Stockton Street Public Safety & Lighting Pilot (SSPSLP) in the Greater Chinatown assists merchants/residents/visitors and SFPD to identify criminal perpetrators and create the critical evidence necessary for filing charges or complaints.

OEWD shall use the SSPSLP's security cameras only for the following authorized purposes:

Authorized Use(s):

1. Live monitoring.
2. Recording of video and images in the event of an incident.
3. Reviewing camera footage.
4. Providing video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident.

Prohibited use cases include any uses not stated in the Authorized Use Case section.

Further, processing of personal data revealing racial or ethnic origin, political opinions, religious or philosophical beliefs, trade union membership, gender, gender identity, disability status, or an individual person's sex life or sexual orientation, and the processing of genetic data and/or biometric data for the purpose of uniquely identifying an individual person shall be prohibited.

Department technology may be deployed in the following locations, based on use case:

SSPSLP's security cameras cover the area between Chinatown Central Subway Station and Stockton Tunnel, with a total 18 HD cameras that cover Stockton Street from Sacramento Street to Washington Street (2 blocks).

Surveillance Oversight Review Dates

COIT Review: TBD

Board of Supervisors Review: TBD

Technology Details

The following is a brief description of the SSPSLP project.

Product description

Cameras: (1) 3×5 MP, WDR, LightCatcher, 4mm, Avigilon Camera; (2) 3×5 MP, WDR, LightCatcher, 2.8mm, Avigilon Camera; (8) 3.0 Megapixel WDR, LightCatcher, Day/Night, Pendant Dome, Avigilon Cameras; (1) Avigilon Box camera, 3.0 MP, 4.7-84.6mm f/1.6 lens

Server: (1) BCDV 1U 2-Bay Rackmount Video Server; (1) BCDV 1U Rackmount 4 Bay Enterprise Video Recording Server Silver

Software: Avigilon Control Center Server ACC6

Solution Overview

- Next generation integrated IP Video with real-time system diagnostics
- Multi-Megapixel exterior network cameras
- Protecting high traffic and high-risk areas
- Scalable system design
- Remotely accessible secure system operation
- End-to-end Managed Support Services

A. How It Works

The technology's primary functions are to provide live views and record video footage to a dedicated, secure server at Union Square Business Improvement District. The system is comprised of multiple cameras connected by data cables and infrastructure to this server. The footage is recorded on the server and stored for a limited amount of time.

Data collected or processed by the SSPSLP project will not be handled or stored by an outside provider or third-party vendor on an ongoing basis. SFPD's Central Police Station will remain the sole Custodian of Record.

To function, SSPSLP is coordinated as part of a larger City strategy to enhance quality of life in Chinatown's major commercial corridor which relies on close collaboration with SFPD, Northeast Community Federal Credit Union (NECFCU, the grantee) and SF Safety Awareness For Everyone (SF SAFE, the contractor), and other City family. OEWD staff work with City departments, community partners and approved contractors to develop strategic plans and best practices.

System Implementation Phases

Phase 1: Audit -- The purpose of this phase is to gather the necessary information to provide initial planning and preparation for system design. The steps in the audit phase help identify and plan the primary focus areas that need to be considered in the design phase.

Phase 2: Design -- The purpose of this phase is to design the system to meet or exceed the SSPSLP project requirements in their specific application. Additional information gathering is conducted during which business processes and specific functional requirements of the SSPSLP are defined and analyzed.

Phase 3: Implementation -- The purpose of this phase is to install the system to meet all objectives and goals established in the design phase. All other technical objectives are identified as part of this phase.

Phase 4: Launch -- The purpose of this phase is to prepare and bring the system "live". Key activities during this phase include the completion of user and administrator training, final system hand over, as well as a final fine-tuning of the system.

Phase 5: Support and analysis -- The purpose of this phase is to provide ongoing support to the SSPSLP project administrators and analyze the project for any areas requiring improvement. "Support" consists primarily of organization of all technical documents and installation documentation and transition of this information to the Support Team through knowledge transfer. Plans are produced for ongoing Support of the SSPSLP's new system.

IMPACT ASSESSMENT

The impact assessment addresses the conditions for surveillance technology approval, as outlined by the Standards of Approval in San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B:

1. The benefits of the surveillance technology outweigh the costs.
2. The Department's Policy safeguards civil liberties and civil rights.
3. The uses and deployments of the surveillance technology are not based upon discriminatory or viewpoint-based factors and do not have a disparate impact on any community or Protected Class.

The Department's use of the surveillance technology is intended to support and benefit the residents of San Francisco while minimizing and mitigating all costs and potential civil rights and liberties impacts of residents.

A. Benefits

The Department's use of security cameras has the following benefits for the residents of the City and County of San Francisco:

- Education
- Community Development

Health

Protect safety of staff, patrons, and facilities while promoting an open and welcoming environment.

Environment

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Criminal Justice	Review video footage after a security incident; provide video evidence to law enforcement or the public upon request by formal process, order, or subpoena.
<input type="checkbox"/>	Jobs	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Housing	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Other	Public Safety - Provides a mechanism to augment foot patrols and prevent criminal acts.

SSPSLP project allows OEWD to create a more active and inviting public realm experience in Chinatown and increase positive awareness of public safety and public health. This project is one part of a comprehensive three-year strategy to support diverse small scale investments aimed at enhancing the visitor and resident experience by strengthening existing businesses, increasing hours of operation and activities, restoring historic signage, activating public open spaces, maintaining cleanliness, increasing cultural economic programming and fostering greater merchant engagement with day to day support on the ground.

B. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards

The Department has considered the potential impacts and has identified the technical, administrative, and physical protections as mitigating measures:

OEWD believes the SSPSLP project poses potential risks to civil liberties in respect to dignity loss and loss of liberty.

OEWD understands the unauthorized use of video surveillance technology can result in serious harm to individuals engaged in conduct that is entirely lawful. When citizens are being watched by the authorities - or aware they might be watched at any time - they are more self-conscious and less free-wheeling. As a result, OEWD and NECFCU do not have access to the camera footage. SFPD and Union Square Business Improvement District can only use camera footage when criminal activity happens. We reduce the risks for loss of dignity by restricting access to live views and recorded footage to a limited number of dedicated staff. The cameras do not pan, tilt or zoom, and audio is not recorded or enabled.

OEWD understands civil liberties problems arise when the City engage in the mass tracking of San Franciscans, most of whom are completely innocent of any wrongdoing. In general, the more intrusive the technology, the more it violates "expectations of privacy" and the greater the threat to civil liberties. As a result, OEWD and SFPD reduce the risks for loss of liberty by restricting access to live views and recorded footage to a limited number of trained personnel. This framework involves balancing the societal interest in maintaining civil liberties protections for the individual against the societal interest in crime investigations.

C. Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits

The Department's use of surveillance cameras yields the following business and operations benefits:

Benefit	Description
X Financial Savings	Department Security Camera Systems will save on building or patrol officers.
X Time Savings	Department Security Camera Systems will run 24/7, thus eliminating building or patrol officer supervision
X Staff Safety	Security cameras help identify violations of Department Patron Code of Conduct and provide assurance that staff safety is emphasized and will be protected at their place of employment.
X Data Quality	Security cameras run 24/7/365 so full-time staffing is not required to subsequently review footage of security incidents. Data resolution can be set by level and is currently set to high resolution.

Number of FTE (new & existing)	N/A	
Classification	N/A	
	Annual Cost	One-Time Cost
Software	\$546.59	\$5,293.82
Hardware/Equipment	\$0.00	\$37,295.55
Professional Services	\$10,600.00	\$41,360.00
Training	\$0.00	\$750.00
Other	\$0.00	\$2,241.80
Total Cost	\$11,146.59	\$86,941.17

The Department funds its use and maintenance of the surveillance technology through Northeast Community Federal Credit Union (NECFCU, the grantee) and SF Safety Awareness For Everyone (SF SAFE, the contractor).

COMPARISON TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS

Unknown. No information whether this technology is currently utilized by other governmental entities for similar purposes.

APPENDIX A: Mapped Crime Statistics

The general location(s) it may be deployed and crime statistics for any location(s),

The location(s) are not specified because our sub-contractor SF SAFE has a nondisclosure agreement with SFPD and Union Square Business Improvement District.