



Surveillance Impact Report

Department of Emergency Management
Security Cameras

As required by San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B, departments must submit a Surveillance Impact Report for each surveillance technology to the Committee on Information Technology ("COIT") and the Board of Supervisors.

The Surveillance Impact Report details the benefits, costs, and potential impacts associated with the Department's use of surveillance cameras.

DESCRIPTION OF THE TECHNOLOGY

The San Francisco Department of Emergency Management (DEM) leads the City in planning, preparedness, communication, response, and recovery for daily emergencies, large scale citywide events, and major disasters. DEM is the vital link in emergency communication between the public and first responders, and provides key coordination and leadership to City departments, stakeholders, residents, and visitors.

In line with its mission, the Department shall use security cameras only for the following authorized purposes:

Authorized Use(s):

1. Live monitoring.
2. Recording of video and images in the event of an incident.
3. Reviewing camera footage.
4. Providing video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident.

Prohibited use cases include any uses not stated in the Authorized Use Case section.

Further, processing of personal data revealing racial or ethnic origin, political opinions, religious or philosophical beliefs, trade union membership, gender, gender identity, disability status, or an individual person's sex life or sexual orientation, and the processing of genetic data and/or biometric data for the purpose of uniquely identifying an individual person shall be prohibited.

Department technology may be deployed in the following locations, based on use case:

- 1011 Turk St – Department of Emergency Management Headquarters

Surveillance Oversight Review Dates

COIT Review: TBD

Board of Supervisors Review: TBD

Technology Details

The following is a product description:

DEM Camera system provides building perimeter visual security for the Combined Emergency Communications Center (CECC) building at 1011 Turk St. The CECC is a critical building for the City's public safety operations, housing both the 9-1-1 Center for the City and County, as well as the Citywide Emergency Operations Center and the Watch Center. The building has 24-hour security, offered by the Sheriff's Department, and it is surrounded on all 4 sides by public parks. There is currently a total of 28 cameras which most of them are fix point focus and 6 pan-tilt-zoom (PTZ) cameras. The video is recorded across two on-premise video servers converting the analog video to digital file format utilizing video management software from Exacqvision. The system current has a retention period of about 21 days to a month. The approximate age of the camera system is at least 7 years old.

The system is primarily used by Sheriff staffed at CECC to monitor for surrounding safety for the occupants of this building and overall perimeter security. There many times the footage of the security camera system is used as evidence to apprehend suspects on criminal event within the view of the cameras within our system. DEM maintains a policy for requesting access to the video camera footage.

Data collected or processed by security cameras will not be handled or stored by an outside provider or third-party vendor on an ongoing basis. The Department will remain the sole Custodian of Record.

IMPACT ASSESSMENT

The impact assessment addresses the conditions for surveillance technology approval, as outlined by the Standards of Approval in San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B:

1. The benefits of the surveillance technology outweigh the costs.
2. The Department's Policy safeguards civil liberties and civil rights.
3. The uses and deployments of the surveillance technology are not based upon discriminatory or viewpoint-based factors and do not have a disparate impact on any community or Protected Class.

The Department's use of the surveillance technology is intended to support and benefit the residents of San Francisco while minimizing and mitigating all costs and potential civil rights and liberties impacts of residents.

A. Benefits

The Department's use of security cameras has the following benefits for the residents of the City and County of San Francisco:

- Education
- Community Development
- Health Protect safety of staff, patrons, and facilities while promoting an open and welcoming environment.
- Environment
- Criminal Justice Review video footage after a security incident; provide video evidence to law enforcement or the public upon request by formal process, order, or subpoena. Deter Crime
- Jobs
- Housing
- Other

B. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards

The Department has considered the potential impacts on civil liberties and has identified the technical, administrative, and physical protections as mitigating measures. The 2 potential impacts that were identified are Dignity Loss and Loss of Liberty.

An individual could suffer dignity loss and experience emotional distress if cameras capture behaviors, appearances, or circumstances by which they might feel humiliated. Examples include individuals ridiculing appearance or behavior, and unlawfully sharing this with other individuals. Risks for loss of dignity are reduced by restricting access to live views and limiting access of trained Security staff. Further, DEM has developed a Security Video Access Policy that is posted on the Intranet, and available to all staff. It covers how to request video footage from the garage, lobby, and exterior cameras. Additionally, the recorded footage has limited retention period, of less than 1 month. Audio is not recorded or enabled.

Loss of liberty could potentially occur if a person were to be misidentified as the perpetrator of a crime or other incident, making them subject to wrongful arrest. An innocent person might be similar in appearance to someone who committed an offense. Surveillance images could reinforce other circumstantial evidence tying the wrong person to a criminal incident. As an example, someone might be wearing clothing like clothing worn by someone seen leaving an office where a theft had just occurred. Loss of liberty risks due to misidentification of a subject in surveillance video is mitigated by restricting access to live views and recorded footage to a limited number of trained personnel.

DEM believes that the following items (Dignity Loss, Discrimination, Economic Loss, Autonomy Loss, Physical or Loss of Trust) are not a potential impact on civil liberties and rights due to the nature of the surveillance system.

C. Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits

The Department’s use of surveillance cameras yields the following business and operations benefits:

Benefit	Description
X Financial Savings	Department Security Camera Systems will save on building or patrol officers.
X Time Savings	Department Security Camera Systems will run 24/7, thus eliminating building or patrol officer supervision
X Staff Safety	Security cameras help identify violations of Department Patron Code of Conduct and provide assurance that staff safety is emphasized and will be protected at their place of employment.
X Data Quality	Security cameras run 24/7/365 so full-time staffing is not required to subsequently review footage of security incidents. Data resolution can be set by level and is currently set to high resolution.

Number of FTE (new & existing)	Estimated at .1 FTE	
Classification	Existing FTE: 1042, 1094	
	Annual Cost	One-Time Cost
Software		
Hardware/Equipment		
Professional Services		
Training		
Other		
Total Cost	\$15,000 (est. based on current system)	\$200-\$800K

The Department funds its use and maintenance of the surveillance technology through

- City General Fund

COMPARISON TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS

Video Cameras are currently utilized by other City Department and other governmental entities for similar purposes.

APPENDIX A: Mapped Crime Statistics

San Francisco Sheriff's Department has given the following statistics regarding surveillance camera usage around 1011 Turk St.

During the calendar year of 2019 and 2020, the Sheriff has used surveillance footage at 1011 Turk St. for 29 incidents. They are the following:

- 7- Vehicle Vandalism
- 4- Hit and Run's
- 6- 849 B PC
- 2 Dog bits incidents
- 4- 5150 (W&C)
- 1- First aid rendered.
- 5 unusual occurrences