



Surveillance Impact Report

Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System
War Memorial

As required by San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B, departments must submit a Surveillance Impact Report for each surveillance technology to the Committee on Information Technology ("COIT") and the Board of Supervisors.

The Surveillance Impact Report details the benefits, costs, and potential impacts associated with the Department's use of the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System.

DESCRIPTION OF THE TECHNOLOGY

The San Francisco War Memorial & Performing Arts Center manages, maintains and operates safe, accessible, world-class venues to promote cultural, educational, and entertainment opportunities in a cost-effective manner for enjoyment by the public, while best serving the purposes and beneficiaries of the War Memorial Trust.

In line with its mission, the War Memorial Security Division utilizes the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System to increase security officer capacity directly related to public safety. The technology enhances the Department's ability to provide a safe and welcoming environment to patrons, visitors and staff.

War Memorial shall use the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System only for the following authorized purposes:

Authorized Use(s):

- Live monitoring.
- Review video footage/images in the event of an incident.
- Provide video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident.

Prohibited use cases include any uses not stated in the Authorized Use Case section.

Technology Details

War Memorial surveillance cameras are located in public areas of all floors in the Veterans Building. Additional cameras are planned for public interior and exterior areas of the Veterans Building.

The following is a product description of the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System:

Cameras: Mobotix S15D FlexMount Dual Camera
Server: Rasilient ApplianceStor90
Software: Avigilon Control Center Server v6.8.6.4.

A. How It Works

The technology's primary functions are to provide live views and record video footage to a dedicated, secure server. The system is comprised of multiple cameras connected by data cables and infrastructure to the server. The footage is recorded on the server and stored for a limited amount of time.

Data collected or processed by the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System will not be handled or stored by an outside provider or third-party vendor on an ongoing basis. The Department will remain the sole Custodian of Record.

IMPACT ASSESSMENT

The impact assessment addresses the conditions for surveillance technology approval, as outlined by the Standards of Approval in San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B:

- A. The benefits of the surveillance technology outweigh the costs.
- B. The Department's Policy safeguards civil liberties and civil rights.
- C. The uses and deployments of the surveillance technology are not based upon discriminatory or viewpoint-based factors and do not have a disparate impact on any community or Protected Class.

The Department's use of the surveillance technology is intended to support and benefit the residents of San Francisco while minimizing and mitigating all costs and potential civil rights and liberties impacts of residents.

A. Benefits

The Department's use of the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System has the following benefits for the residents of the City and County of San Francisco:

- Education
- Community Development
- Health
- Environment
- Criminal Justice May provide evidence for law enforcement criminal investigations.
- Jobs
- Housing

- Other Public Safety
 - Assists security officers investigating War Memorial Code of Conduct violations and/or criminal acts.
 - Provides a mechanism to augment foot patrols, prevent criminal acts, and assist anyone requiring emergency help.

B. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards

The Department has considered the potential impacts and has identified the technical, administrative, and physical protections as mitigating measures:

War Memorial believes the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System poses potential risks to civil liberties in respect to dignity loss and loss of liberty.

An individual could be embarrassed or experience emotional distress if cameras capture behaviors, appearances, or circumstances by which they might feel humiliated. Examples include views of someone exhibiting an emotional outburst, a person's clothing or hair being disheveled, or someone having their physique ridiculed or leered at. Risks for loss of dignity are reduced by restricting access to live views, as well as recorded footage, to a limited number of trained Security staff. In addition, the cameras do not pan, tilt or zoom, thus removing possible temptation for system operators to use those features to follow or enhance views of individuals. Audio is also not recorded or enabled.

Loss of liberty could potentially occur if a person were to be misidentified as the perpetrator of a crime or other incident, making them subject to wrongful arrest. An innocent person might be similar in appearance to someone who committed an offense. Surveillance images could reinforce other circumstantial evidence tying the wrong person to a criminal incident. As an example, someone might be wearing clothing like clothing worn by someone seen leaving an office where a theft had just occurred. Loss of liberty risks due to misidentification of a subject in surveillance video is mitigated by restricting access to live views and recorded footage to a limited number of trained personnel.

C. Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits

The Department's use of Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System yields the following business and operations benefits:

Benefit	Description
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial savings	Reduce the number of Security staff needed to secure the Veterans Building.
<input type="checkbox"/> Time savings	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Staff safety	Enhances Security staff's ability to observe patrons, visitors and staff members requiring assistance. May provide an alert and help prevent or mitigate dangerous incidents.
<input type="checkbox"/> Improved data quality	
<input type="checkbox"/> Other	

The total fiscal cost, including initial purchase, personnel and other ongoing costs is

FTE (new & existing)	.25 of 1 8207's time 2.5% of 1 1093's time (est. 1 hour per week)		
Classification	8207 and 1093		
	Annual Cost	Years	One-Time Cost
Total Salary & Fringe	\$32,697	0	\$0
Software	\$0	0	\$4,260

Hardware/Equipment	\$0	0	\$14,730
Professional Services	\$0	0	\$5,520
Training	\$0	0	\$570
Other	\$0	0	\$140,000
Total Cost [Auto-calculate]	\$197,777		

2.1 Please disclose any current or potential sources of funding (e.g. potential sources = prospective grant recipients, etc.). ^{SIR, ASR}

The Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System is an existing system that was installed during the Veterans Building Seismic Retrofit and Renovation Project completed in 2015. A subsequent project to upgrade the Surveillance Camera server and software was completed in 2018. Of the Total Cost of \$197,777, \$165,080 has already been expended. Salary & Fringe costs of \$32,697 are ongoing annual costs. The War Memorial funds the ongoing costs associated with this system through its Annual Operating Budget.

The Department funds its use and maintenance of the surveillance technology through Annual Operating Budget.

COMPARISON TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS

Surveillance Camera Technologies like the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System are currently utilized by other governmental entities for similar purposes.

APPENDIX A: Surveillance Impact Report Requirements

The following section shows all Surveillance Impact Report requirements in order as defined by the San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B.

1. Information describing the Surveillance Technology and how it works, including product descriptions from manufacturers.

The technology's primary functions are to provide live views and record video footage to a dedicated, secure server. The system is comprised of multiple cameras connected by data cables and infrastructure to the server. The footage is recorded on the server and stored for a limited amount of time.

Cameras: Mobotix S15D FlexMount Dual Camera
 Server: Raslient ApplianceStor90
 Software: Avigilon Control Center Server v6.8.6.4

2. Information on the proposed purpose(s) for the Surveillance Technology.

The War Memorial Security Division utilizes surveillance technology to increase security officer capacity directly related to public safety. The technology enhances the Department's ability to provide a safe and welcoming environment to patrons, visitors and staff.

3. If applicable, the general location(s) it may be deployed and crime statistics for any location(s).

Existing surveillance cameras are located in public areas of all floors in the Veterans Building. Additional cameras are planned for public interior and exterior areas of the Veterans Building.

4. An assessment identifying any potential impact on civil liberties and civil rights and discussing any plans to safeguard the rights of the public.

War Memorial believes the Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System poses potential risks to civil liberties in respect to dignity loss and loss of liberty.

An individual could be embarrassed or experience emotional distress if cameras capture behaviors, appearances or circumstances by which they might feel humiliated. Examples include views of someone exhibiting an emotional outburst, a person's clothing or hair being disheveled, or someone having their physique ridiculed or leered at. Risks for loss of dignity are reduced by restricting access to live views, as well as recorded footage, to a limited number of trained Security staff. In addition, the cameras do not pan, tilt or zoom, thus removing possible temptation for system operators to use those features to follow or enhance views of individuals. Audio is also not recorded or enabled.

Loss of liberty could potentially occur if a person were to be misidentified as the perpetrator of a crime or other incident, making them subject to wrongful arrest. An innocent person might be similar in appearance to someone who actually committed an offense. Surveillance images could reinforce other circumstantial evidence tying the wrong person to a criminal incident. As an example, someone might be wearing clothing similar to clothing worn by someone seen leaving an office where a theft had just occurred. Loss of liberty risks due to misidentification of a subject in surveillance video is mitigated by restricting access to live views and recorded footage to a limited number of trained personnel.

5. The fiscal costs for the Surveillance Technology, including initial purchase, personnel and other ongoing costs, and any current or potential sources of funding.

Number of FTE (new & existing)	.25 of 1 8207's time 2.5% of 1 1093's time (est 1 hour per week)
Classification	8207 and 1093
Total Salary & Fringe	\$32,697
Software	\$4,260

Hardware/Equipment	\$14,730
Professional Services	\$5,520
Training	\$570
Other	\$140,000
Total Cost [Auto-calculate]	\$197,777

Funding Source:

The Veterans Building Surveillance Camera System is an existing system that was installed during the Veterans Building Seismic Retrofit and Renovation Project completed in 2015. A subsequent project to upgrade the Surveillance Camera server and software was completed in 2018. Of the Total Cost of \$197,777, \$165,080 has already been expended. Salary & Fringe costs of \$32,697 are ongoing annual costs. The War Memorial funds the ongoing costs associated with this system through its Annual Operating Budget.

6. Whether use or maintenance of the technology will require data gathered by the technology to be handled or stored by a third-party vendor on an ongoing basis.

Handled by third-party vendor, ongoing:

Vendor name:

Special data handling required:

7. A summary of the experience, if any, other governmental entities have had with the proposed technology, including information about its effectiveness and any known adverse information about the technology such as anticipated costs, failures, or civil rights and civil liberties abuses.

N/A