



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

Minutes

Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting City and County of San Francisco

Friday, August 14, 2020
9:00 am – 11:00 am

To view the online presentation, join the meeting using the link below:

<https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e7ef8ccb8c2c135432da08bea34445a9e>

If you wish to offer public comment, call in using the number +1-408-418-9388 and access code 146 913 8724

A toll-free number is +1 415 655-0001

Coit.staff@sfgov.org can be used as an email address when joining the WebEx event

Members

Taraneh Moayed – Chair, Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration
Mark de la Rosa – Acting Chief Auditor Executive, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Jason Lally – Data Services Manager, DataSF
Brian Roberts – Policy Analyst, Department of Technology
Todd Rydstrom – Deputy Controller, Controller's Office
Matthias Jaime – Director, Committee on Information Technology
Nnena Ukuku – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mr. Matthias Jaime called the meeting to order at 9:10am.

2. Roll call

Jason Lally
Brian Roberts
Matthias Jaime
Nnena Ukuku
Mark de la Rosa
Todd Rydstrom

COIT Staff

Emma Fernandez

Luke O'Neill
Inthisar Kamal
Marlee Burns

Department Representatives

Asja Steeves
Lt. Dave O'Connor
Isidro Jimenez
Robert Aicardi
Shawn McCormick
Hank Wilson
Christine Nath
Marcus Garcia

Members of the Public

David Pilpel

3. Approval of Minutes

Public comment from David Pilpel on the July 24, 2020 minutes included a request to add two new sections under roll call: Department Representatives and Members of the Public.

The minutes of July 24, 2020 were approved without changes.

4. Review of Revised Surveillance Technology Policy: Automated License Plate Reader (Discussion Item)

Police (SFPD)

Ms. Asja Steeves presented SFPD's Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR) policy. SFPD's proposed authorized uses for ALPR include locating stolen, wanted, or other vehicles that are subject to investigation; locating and/or apprehending individuals subject to arrest warrants or who are otherwise lawfully sought by law enforcement; locating victims, witnesses, or suspects associated with a law enforcement investigation; locating missing children, adults and/or elderly individuals associated with Amber or Silver Alerts; supporting outside law enforcement agencies in the identification of vehicles associated with targets of criminal investigations; and identifying potential threats to critical infrastructure.

Ms. Asja Steeves explained that SFPD's ALPR technology is only intended to capture images of license plates, geolocation of capture, and the date and time associated with the capture. It does not capture names of individuals, addresses of individuals, social security numbers, etc.

Ms. Asja Steeves explained that the Northern California Regional Intelligence Center (NCRIC) hosts SFPD's ALPR data. Only SFPD employees granted permission may access the data via the NCRIC database vendor application. The data retention period is 12 months from the date of capture, unless the data is connected to a criminal investigation – the retention period is 5 years in this case.

Data sharing is only allowed for law enforcement purposes.

PSAB members provided a variety of feedback, and SFPD will update their Impact Report and Technology Policy to address the following issues:

- Hotlist
 - o Clarify 'hotlist' term in policy and impact report
 - o Investigate how SFPD ensures people are not inappropriately placed on a hotlist which then ALPR is used to enforce
 - o Investigate how to measure the effectiveness of ALPR (through reporting)
- Clarify communication and data sharing between SFPD, NCRIC, DOJ.
- Provide parameters around "canvassing" capability.
- Share police district and sectors map.
- Other changes to Policy and Impact Report
 - o In the Impact Report, the cost for software field is blank – request to state any payments with NCRIC for use of the software.
 - o In the data classification section of the Policy, we want to standardize these elements across all departments.
 - o In the data retention section of the Policy, remove the two columns.

Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)

SFMTA representatives provided a brief overview of changes to their Surveillance Policy Toolkit. The conversation between PSAB and SFMTA covered the civil liberties section of the Impact Report and data sharing practices, including SFMTA's File Transfer Protocols (FTP).

PSAB members provided a variety of feedback, and SFPD will update their Impact Report and Technology Policy to address the following issues:

- Update the Policy and Impact Report with FTP language and any other details of how hotlist data is transmitted.
- Bring contract with SaaS product provider.

5. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:01am.