Minutes
Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Friday, July 24, 2020
10:00 am – 11:00 am

To view the online presentation, join the meeting using this link:
https://ccsf.webex.com/ccsf/onstage/g.php?MTID=e7e7a662df654e2c05949ae98ea5bdf37

If you wish to offer public comment, call in using the phone number (408) 418-9388 and access code 146 462 9851

A toll-free number is +1 415 655-0001

Coit.staff@sfgov.org can be used as an email address when joining the WebEx event

Members
Taraneh Moayed – Chair, Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration
Mark de la Rosa – Acting Chief Auditor Executive, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Jason Lally – Data Services Manager, DataSF
Brian Roberts – Policy Analyst, Department of Technology
Todd Rydstrom – Deputy Controller, Controller's Office
Matthias Jaime – Director, Committee on Information Technology
Nnena Ukuku – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Ms. Taraneh Moayed called the meeting to order at 10:05.

2. Roll call
Taraneh Moayed
Jason Lally
Brian Roberts
Matthias Jaime
Nnena Ukuku
Mark de la Rosa

COIT Staff
Emma Fernandez
Luke O'Neill
Inthisar Kamal
Marlee Burns

Public Members
Dina Quesada
Daniel Wu
Carla Short
Larry Stringer
David Pilpel

3. Approval of Minutes

The minutes of July 10, 2020 were approved without changes.

4. Review and Approval of Revised Surveillance Technology Policy: Toll Reader (Action Item)

Airport (AIR)
Ms. Dina Quesada and Mr. Daniel Wu presented Airport's Toll Reader Surveillance Technology Policy. San Francisco International Airport (SFO) uses 42 Toll Readers set up at 21 locations in the airport to record commercial ground transportation activity. Ms. Quesada shared that the Toll Readers record the activity of limos and taxis who have previously applied for permits to operate at the airport; they do not record the activity of the public, including Lyfts and Ubers. Specifically, SFO uses Toll Readers to calculate charges for commercial ground transportation and fines.

The Toll Reader data is one element of SFO's Ground Transportation Management System (GTMS), which also includes data collected from automated license plate readers (ALPRs). When necessary (e.g., in a dispute regarding a fine or charge), SFO will compare Toll Reader data to ALPR data in the GTMS. SFO's use of ALPR will be reviewed by PSAB at a subsequent meeting.

In terms of obtaining consent, Ms. Quesada and Mr. Wu made clear that the providers of commercial ground transportation are aware of SFO's Toll Readers and complete an Airport orientation when applying for an operating permit.

SFO also clarified that staff may share license plate data with San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) and the City Attorney, as requested. SFO shares data with San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) on an ongoing basis. The data collected from SFO's Toll Readers is active for 18 months in the production server, and 4.5 years in cloud storage.

PSAB members provided a variety of feedback, and SFO will update their Impact Report and Technology Policy to address the following issues:
- Describe the process for handling non permitted license plate data
- Capture the process for sharing data with SFPD and City Attorney
- Work with legal team to discuss feasibility of separating data and developing different retention policies of different data sets
- Pull the number of times Toll Readers have captured violations of the permitting process

PSAB members deferred action on this item in favor of further review in a subsequent meeting. There was no public comment.

5. **Review of Surveillance Technology Policy: Automated License Plate Readers (Public Works) (Action Item)**

Public Works (PW)
Mr. Larry Stringer and Ms. Carla Short presented Public Works' Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR) policy. Mr. Stringer described how illegal dumping has been a problem for many years in San Francisco. The City spends 10M per year on illegal dumping. District 10 in San Francisco has the worst illegal dumping. Illegal dumping affects the quality of life for San Francisco residents and can become a confrontational issue within a neighborhood.

Public Works is currently piloting ALPR strategically in dumping hotspots. Public Works has decided to use ALPR because it can more effectively identify offenders. They first tried cameras in 2006 but couldn't catch license plate information with cameras because of lighting issues.

Public Works plans to share ALPR data only with the City Attorney and San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) as needed.

PSAB members provided a variety of feedback, and SFPW will update their Impact Report and Technology Policy to address the following issues:
- Flesh out civil liberties section of the Policy.
    - How does Public Works identify hotspots of illegal dumping?
    - How will Public Works place technology in a way that avoids impacting vulnerable communities?
    - Administrative, Technical, and Physical controls when collecting incidental data that is not needed for authorized purposes.

6. **Public Comment**

David Pilpel requested a PDF of the agenda before the meeting.

7. **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 11:07am.