



Committee on Information Technology
Office of the City Administrator
San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes
Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Friday, January 24, 2020
9:00 am – 11:00 am
City Hall, Room 408

Members

Alaric Degrafinried – Chair, Purchaser and Director, Office of Contract Administration
Steve Flaherty – Principal Auditor, Controller's Office
Jason Lally – Data Services Manager, DataSF
Brian Roberts – Policy Analyst, Department of Technology
Todd Rydstrom – Deputy Controller, Controller's Office
Nnena Ukuku – Public Member
Matthias Jaime – Director, Committee on Information Technology

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mr. Alaric Degrafinried called the meeting to order at 9:03 am.

2. Roll call

Alaric Degrafinried
Steve Flaherty
Jason Lally
Brian Roberts
Todd Rydstrom
Matthias Jaime

COIT Staff

Emma Fernandez

3. Approval of Minutes

The minutes of November 22, 2019 were approved without changes.

4. Department Update: Amendment to Section 19B Acquisition of Surveillance Technology Ordinance

Ms. Emma Fernandez provided a summary on the Amendment to Section 19B passed in December, including facial recognition, ordinance enforcement, and implementing

standards. Ms. Fernandez reviewed the 25 technologies submitted by departments that were determined to fall under existing ordinance exemptions by the City Administrator.

5. Action: Proposed Additional Exemptions to Section 19B Acquisition of Surveillance Technology Ordinance

Mr. Matthias Jaime presented technologies that do not fall under an existing exemption in the ordinance, but that COIT staff recommend sharing with the City Administrator for consideration for a new exemption. These technologies fall into two categories: opt-in communication, and network services.

After member discussion, the Board unanimously voted to share these recommendations with the City Administrator.

6. Continued Discussion of Potential Surveillance Technology Exemptions

Mr. Matthias Jaime presented technologies that may be outside the scope of the Ordinance. These technologies fall into three categories: marketing analytics & automation, social media monitoring, and telematics.

After member discussion, the Board decided to hear more information about these technologies at the next meeting.

7. Action: Proposed Ordinance Amendments

Ms. Fernandez presented COIT staff recommendations of clarifying amendments to the ordinance.

After member discussion, the Board unanimously voted to share these recommendations with the City Administrator.

8. Action: San Francisco Public Library RFID

Members reviewed the San Francisco Public Library's Surveillance Technology Policy for radio-frequency identification with Shellie Cocking from SFPL.

Ms. Cocking highlighted that SFPL uses RFID technology specifically for inventory control. It tracks books, DVDs, and other collection items based on a 14-digit barcode on the front cover of the item, not on bibliographic information. Ms. Cocking noted that this technology is a passive RFID technology, which only displays a signal if a power source is brought to it. The tag is encrypted and only a reader with that technology could decrypt the information. This is in contrast to an active tag, where information could be read at a wider range. In response to a question from Mr. Todd Rydstrom, Ms. Cocking highlighted the benefits to employees of the technology, including reducing worker strain and injury, preventing worker's compensation needs, and enabling blind employees to use the technology.

Members noted that some of the language in the Surveillance Technology Policy contained references to “PII” even though this technology does not collect any PII. Members suggested the following edits to the Surveillance Technology Policy:

- Page 1: Remove the last paragraph beginning “Further, processing of personal data...”
- Page 4: Edit the “Notification” language from “No personally identifiable information (PII) is collected or tracked, so the Library does not post a notice.” to “No personally identifiable information (PII) is collected or tracked through this technology, so the Library does not post a notice.”
- Page 6: Remove the third paragraph under “Data Sharing” beginning “Department shall ensure all PII and restricted data...”
- Page 6: Replace the first paragraph under “Data Retention” with the following: “While the department does not collect PII through this technology, it adheres to the following data retention period and justification for the data it does collect.”

After member questions, members unanimously approved the SFPL Surveillance Technology Policy with the specified edits.

9. Public Comment

Eli Hill provided public comment.

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:28 am.